

# DEVELOPMENT OF A HOUSING POLICY SIMULATION MODEL

---

A REVIEW A REGIONAL CGE MODEL FOR  
HOUSING POLICY ANALYSIS IN CANADA



---

## FINAL REPORT

REVIEW OF CGE MODELS AND THEIR APPLICATIONS

---

JUNE 14, 2007

2111 LAKE SHORE BLVD. WEST, SUITE 1502, TORONTO, ONTARIO M8V 4B2  
TEL: 416-318-1365, EMAIL: MURTAZA@REGIONOMICS.COM

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<b>1. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY .....</b>	<b>1</b>
1.1. STATEMENT OF RESEARCH OBJECTIVES .....	1
1.2. MAJOR FINDINGS .....	2
1.3. CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS .....	3
<b>2. PHASE 1: REVIEW OF CGE MODELS AND THEIR APPLICATIONS.....</b>	<b>4</b>
2.1. ORIGIN OF CGE MODELS.....	4
2.2. APPLICATION OF CGE MODELS TO POLICY ISSUES.....	6
2.2.1. <i>Trade-Focused Neoclassical Economy-Wide Macro Models</i> .....	6
2.2.2. <i>Integrating Environmental data sources into a CGE framework</i> .....	7
2.2.3. <i>CGE Models and Taxation and Fiscal Policies</i> .....	8
2.2.4. <i>Structural Adjustment Programs and Modeling Income Distribution Impacts</i> .....	9
2.2.5. <i>Interregional CGE Models</i> .....	10
2.2.6. <i>Regional CGE Applications</i> .....	10
<b>3. CGE MODELS FOR CANADA.....</b>	<b>12</b>
3.1. CANADA FOCUSED TRADE MODELS .....	12
3.2. CANADIAN ENVIRONMENTAL CGE MODELS .....	15
3.3. CANADIAN INTERREGIONAL TRANSPORTATION CGE MODELS .....	16
3.4. CANADIAN TAXATION AND FISCAL CGE MODELS .....	17
3.5. CGE MODELS AND HOUSING POLICY .....	17
<b>4. ADVANTAGES AND DISADVANTAGES OF CGE MODELS .....</b>	<b>19</b>
4.1. PRICES MATTER.....	20
4.2. INTERACTIONS MATTER.....	20
4.3. ECONOMIC STRUCTURE MATTERS .....	20
4.4. POLICY RELEVANCE .....	21
4.5. TRANSPARENCY .....	22
4.6. TIMELESSNESS .....	22
4.7. VALIDATION AND ESTIMATION.....	22
4.8. DIVERSITY OF APPROACHES .....	23
<b>5. TECHNICAL DESCRIPTION OF THE NEW YORK CGE MODEL.....</b>	<b>24</b>
5.1. DATA AND SOFTWARE DESCRIPTION .....	24
5.2. TECHNICAL DESCRIPTION OF THE GENERIC COMPONENTS .....	28
5.3. THE PRICE BLOCK.....	28
5.3.1. <i>Foreign Import Price</i> .....	28
5.3.2. <i>Foreign Export Price</i> .....	29
5.3.3. <i>Regional Import and Export Prices</i> .....	29
5.3.4. <i>Absorption</i> .....	30
5.3.5. <i>Regional Output Volume</i> .....	30
5.3.6. <i>Activity (Producer) Price</i> .....	30
5.3.7. <i>Value-added Price</i> .....	31
5.3.8. <i>Capital Goods Price</i> .....	31
5.3.9. <i>Price Index</i> .....	31
5.4. MARKET TRANSACTIONS – THE ACTIVITY/COMMODITY AND TRADE BLOCK.....	32

5.4.1.	<i>Composite Import (Armington) Function</i> .....	33
5.4.2.	<i>Domestic-Foreign Import Ratio</i> .....	33
5.4.3.	<i>Composite Supply (Armington) Function</i> .....	34
5.4.4.	<i>Regional-Import Demand Ratio</i> .....	34
5.4.5.	<i>Activity Value-added Production Function</i> .....	35
5.4.6.	<i>Factor Demand – Profit Maximizing Producer</i> .....	35
5.4.7.	<i>Intermediate Input Demand</i> .....	36
5.4.8.	<i>Activity - Commodity Output Function</i> .....	36
5.4.9.	<i>Output Transformation (CET) Function</i> .....	36
5.4.10.	<i>Export-Regional Supply Ratio</i> .....	37
5.4.11.	<i>Composite Export (CET) Function</i> .....	37
5.4.12.	<i>Foreign-Domestic Supply Ratio</i> .....	37
5.5.	<b>FACTOR INCOME AND TRANSFER PAYMENTS - THE INSTITUTION BLOCK</b> .....	38
5.5.1.	<i>Factor Income &amp; Total Factor Income</i> .....	38
5.5.2.	<i>Household Labor Income (Employed)</i> .....	39
5.5.3.	<i>Household Labor Income (Self-employed)</i> .....	39
5.5.4.	<i>Household Capital Income</i> .....	39
5.5.5.	<i>Factor Income Tax Revenues</i> .....	40
5.5.6.	<i>Depreciation</i> .....	40
5.5.7.	<i>Retained Industry Revenues</i> .....	41
5.5.8.	<i>Enterprise/Corporate Profits</i> .....	41
5.5.9.	<i>Gross Enterprise Revenues</i> .....	41
5.5.10.	<i>Enterprise Tax Payments</i> .....	41
5.5.11.	<i>Enterprise Savings</i> .....	42
5.5.12.	<i>Net Enterprise Income</i> .....	42
5.5.13.	<i>Gross Household Revenues</i> .....	42
5.5.14.	<i>Household Tax Payments</i> .....	43
5.5.15.	<i>Intra-Household Transfers</i> .....	43
5.5.16.	<i>Household Savings</i> .....	43
5.5.17.	<i>Household Disposable Income</i> .....	44
5.5.18.	<i>Household Consumption Demand</i> .....	44
5.5.19.	<i>Indirect Business Tax Revenues</i> .....	45
5.5.20.	<i>Government Revenue</i> .....	45
5.5.21.	<i>Government Expenditure</i> .....	45
5.5.22.	<i>Government Consumption</i> .....	46
5.5.23.	<i>Inventory Investment</i> .....	46
5.5.24.	<i>Fixed Investment Demand</i> .....	47
5.5.25.	<i>Investment by Sector of Destination</i> .....	47
5.5.26.	<i>Investment by Sector of Origin</i> .....	47
5.6.	<b>EQUILIBRIUM AND MARKET CLEARING CONDITIONS - THE SYSTEM CONSTRAINT BLOCK</b> .....	49
5.6.1.	<i>Composite Commodity Market Balance</i> .....	49
5.6.2.	<i>Factor Market Equilibrium</i> .....	49
5.6.3.	<i>Foreign Current Account Balance (ROW)</i> .....	50
5.6.4.	<i>Domestic Current Account Balance (ROUS)</i> .....	50
5.6.5.	<i>Savings Constraint</i> .....	50
5.6.6.	<i>Value-added Gross State Product</i> .....	51
5.6.7.	<i>Real Gross State Product</i> .....	51
<b>6.</b>	<b>TECHNICAL DESCRIPTION OF HOUSING MARKET MODULE OF THE CGE MODEL</b> .....	<b>53</b>
6.1.	<b>PECULIARITIES OF HOUSING IN AN ACCOUNTING FRAMEWORK</b> .....	<b>54</b>
6.2.	<b>MODELING HOUSING IN THE REGIONAL NEW YORK STATE CGE MODEL</b> .....	<b>56</b>
6.2.1.	<i>Housing Demand (CES) Function</i> .....	57
6.2.2.	<i>Housing – Non-housing Demand Ratio</i> .....	57
6.2.3.	<i>Price of Aggregated Housing Bundle</i> .....	57

6.2.4.	<i>Price of Aggregated Non-housing Bundle</i> .....	57
6.2.5.	<i>Aggregated Investment</i> .....	59
6.2.6.	<i>Fixed Investment Equation</i> .....	59
6.2.7.	<i>Aggregated Private Investment</i> .....	59
6.2.8.	<i>Utility Maximizing Households - Total Investment in Housing</i> .....	60
6.2.9.	<i>Utility Maximizing Households – Total Investment in Non-housing</i> .....	60
6.2.10.	<i>Private Non-housing Investment Equation</i> .....	60
6.2.11.	<i>Private Housing Investment Equation</i> .....	60
6.2.12.	<i>Utility Maximizing Households – Individual Investment in Housing</i> .....	61
6.2.13.	<i>Volume of Private Housing Investment</i> .....	61
6.2.14.	<i>Volume of Private Non-housing Investment</i> .....	61
6.2.15.	<i>Volume of Private Investment</i> .....	62
6.3.	<b>VARIABLE AND PARAMETER NOTATIONS OF THE NYS CGE MODEL</b> .....	63
6.3.1.	<i>Endogenous Variables</i> .....	63
6.3.2.	<i>Exogenous Variables</i> .....	64
6.3.3.	<i>Functional Parameters</i> .....	65
6.3.4.	<i>Shares, Rates, Coefficients, and Base Parameters</i> .....	65
6.3.5.	<i>Subscripts, Superscripts, and Abbreviations</i> .....	66
<b>7.</b>	<b>PHASE 2: APPLICATIONS OF THE CGE MODEL WITH HOUSING IMPLICATIONS</b> .....	<b>67</b>
<b>8.</b>	<b>SIMULATING THE IMPACT OF HOUSING PROGRAMS IN CGE MODELS</b> .....	<b>68</b>
8.1.	<b>IMPACT OF DIRECT HOUSING PROGRAMS</b> .....	68
8.1.1.	<i>Affordable Housing Programs</i> .....	71
8.1.1.1.	<i>Application of NYS-RCGE Model to Evaluate Affordable Housing Program</i> .....	72
8.1.2.	<i>Social Housing Programs</i> .....	74
8.1.3.	<i>Residential Rehabilitation Assistance Programs (RRAP)</i> .....	74
8.1.3.1.	<i>Homeowner RRAP</i> .....	75
8.1.3.2.	<i>Rental RRAP</i> .....	76
8.1.3.3.	<i>Other Residential Rehabilitation Assistance Programs</i> .....	79
8.1.4.	<i>Mortgage Loan Insurance Programmes for First Time Home Buyers</i> .....	80
8.1.4.1.	<i>Application of NYS-RCGE Model to Evaluate MLI</i> .....	83
8.1.5.	<i>Mortgage Loan Insurance Programmes for Rental Housing</i> .....	84
8.1.5.1.	<i>Application of NYS-RCGE Model to Evaluate MLI for Rental Housing</i> .....	85
8.1.6.	<i>Mortgage Backed Securities</i> .....	85
8.1.6.1.	<i>Application of NYS-RCGE Model to Evaluate MBS</i> .....	86
8.2.	<b>IMPACT OF MEASURES WITH HOUSING IMPLICATIONS</b> .....	86
8.2.1.1.	<i>Application of NYS-RCGE Model to Evaluate Measures with Housing Implications</i> .....	87
8.3.	<b>IMPACT OF DIFFERENT POLICY INSTRUMENTS ON HOUSING</b> .....	88
8.3.1.	<i>Cleaning Up of Contaminated Sites Costing \$3.5 Billion</i> .....	88
8.3.2.	<i>Impact of Policies on First Nations Housing</i> .....	97
8.3.3.	<i>Simulating the Impact of Economic Performance</i> .....	99
<b>9.</b>	<b>EVALUATION OF NYS-RCGE MODEL</b> .....	<b>101</b>
9.1.	<b>DATA SOURCES REQUIRED FOR CONSTRUCTING A CANADIAN SAM</b> .....	102
9.1.1.	<i>Canadian Input-Output Tables</i> .....	102
9.1.2.	<i>Household Income-Expenditure Data</i> .....	106
9.1.3.	<i>Housing Consumption</i> .....	107
9.2.	<b>STRENGTHS, WEAKNESS, AND LIMITATIONS OF NYS-RCGE MODEL</b> .....	108
9.3.	<b>CHALLENGES AND OPPORTUNITIES IN DEVELOPING A CANADIAN SAM</b> .....	110
9.3.1.	<i>Model Design and Spatial Scale Issues</i> .....	110
9.3.2.	<i>Discussions with Professor Randal Wigle</i> .....	110
9.3.3.	<i>Necessary adjustments</i> .....	111
9.3.4.	<i>Readiness for adaptability</i> .....	111
9.4.	<b>RECOMMENDATIONS</b> .....	111

<b>10.</b>	<b>PHASE 3: PROS, CONS AND IMPLICATIONS .....</b>	<b>113</b>
10.1.	PROS .....	113
10.1.1.	<i>Comprehensiveness and Breadth of Scope .....</i>	<i>113</i>
10.1.2.	<i>Endogenous Generation of Factor Prices and Incomes .....</i>	<i>114</i>
10.1.3.	<i>Flexibility in the Range of Issues that can be Examined/Evaluated .....</i>	<i>117</i>
10.1.4.	<i>Accounting and Theoretical Consistency .....</i>	<i>118</i>
10.1.5.	<i>The Ability to Assess the Welfare Implications of Policies .....</i>	<i>118</i>
10.2.	CONS .....	119
10.2.1.	<i>Developing a Canadian SAM .....</i>	<i>120</i>
10.2.2.	<i>A National Focus .....</i>	<i>120</i>
10.2.3.	<i>Parameterization Issues .....</i>	<i>122</i>
<b>11.</b>	<b>ASSESSMENT OF OTHER ALTERNATIVES TO CGE MODEL .....</b>	<b>124</b>
11.1.	INPUT-OUTPUT MODELS AND HOUSING POLICY ANALYSIS .....	124
11.2.	INTEGRATED LAND USE & ECONOMIC MODELS .....	128
11.2.1.	<i>UrbanSim .....</i>	<i>129</i>
11.2.2.	<i>Delta Modelling framework .....</i>	<i>133</i>
11.2.2.1.	<i>Capabilities of DELTA model .....</i>	<i>133</i>
11.2.2.2.	<i>Resource requirements to operationalize the model .....</i>	<i>133</i>
11.2.3.	<i>Limitations of ILUTE models .....</i>	<i>134</i>
11.3.	SYSTEM DYNAMICS MODELLING .....	135
11.3.1.	<i>Limitations of SD models .....</i>	<i>139</i>
<b>12.</b>	<b>POSSIBLE FUTURE DIRECTIONS .....</b>	<b>141</b>
12.1.	OPTIONS TO IMPLEMENT A CGE MODEL .....	141
12.1.1.	<i>Build From Scratch .....</i>	<i>141</i>
12.1.2.	<i>Adapt an Existing CGE Model .....</i>	<i>142</i>
12.2.	LOGISTICS FOR DEVELOPING A HOUSING SIMULATION MODEL .....	143
<b>13.</b>	<b>CONCLUSIONS .....</b>	<b>145</b>
<b>14.</b>	<b>RECOMMENDATIONS .....</b>	<b>147</b>
<b>APPENDICES .....</b>		<b>149</b>
APPENDIX A: GENERAL STRUCTURE OF THE MFQ SAM .....		149
APPENDIX B: STRUCTURE OF THE MFQ SAM AS PRESENTED IN MFQ (2003) .....		150
APPENDIX B: STRUCTURE OF THE MFQ SAM AS PRESENTED IN MFQ (2003) – CONTINUED... ..		151
APPENDIX B: STRUCTURE OF THE MFQ SAM AS PRESENTED IN MFQ (2003) – CONTINUED... ..		152
APPENDIX B: STRUCTURE OF THE MFQ SAM AS PRESENTED IN MFQ (2003) – CONCLUDED .....		153
APPENDIX C: INTRODUCTION TO THE DELTA PACKAGE .....		154
APPENDIX D: SAMPLE MODEL OF URBAN DYNAMICS .....		170
APPENDIX E: STRUCTURE OF THE REMI MODEL .....		173
<b>15.</b>	<b>REFERENCES .....</b>	<b>176</b>
15.1.	CANADIAN CGE LITERATURE .....	181

## LIST OF TABLES

TABLE 1: SECTORAL BREAKDOWN OF THE RNYS-CGE MODEL .....	26
TABLE 2: DEMAND FOR HOUSING IN NEW YORK STATE (IN MILLIONS OF 1996 DOLLARS) .....	53
TABLE 3: BREAKDOWN OF LOAN AMOUNTS FOR VARIOUS REGIONS .....	75
TABLE 4: BREAKDOWN OF LOAN AMOUNTS FOR VARIOUS REGIONS .....	77
TABLE 5: SECTORAL AND COMMODITY DETAIL IN CANADIAN IO DATA .....	104
TABLE 6: COMPARISON OF MODELLING FRAMEWORKS FROM AN IMPLEMENTATION POINT OF VIEW .....	144

## LIST OF FIGURES

FIGURE 1: STRUCTURE OF ACTIVITY OUTPUT AND COMMODITY FLOW IN THE RNYS-CGE MODEL .....	32
FIGURE 2: HOUSEHOLDS WITH DIFFERENT INDIFFERENCE CURVES (I) AND BUDGET LINES (B) .....	56
FIGURE 3: TWO-LEVEL NESTED INVESTMENT TREE .....	58
FIGURE 4: A FRAMEWORK TO EVALUATE IMPACTS OF GOVERNMENT'S INVESTMENT IN HOUSING PROGRAMS .....	70
FIGURE 5: CONSUMPTION PATTERNS OF A DISADVANTAGED HOUSEHOLD WITH AND WITHOUT HOUSING SUBSIDY .....	71
FIGURE 6: CONCEPTUAL FRAMEWORK FOR UNDERSTANDING THE RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN BROWNFIELD REDEVELOPMENT ACTIVITIES AND BROADER SOCIOECONOMIC AND ENVIRONMENTAL SYSTEMS .....	91
FIGURE 7: INCOME MULTIPLICATION PROCESS ASSOCIATED WITH THE BRC IN CANADA .....	92
FIGURE 8: SOCIAL ACCOUNTING MATRIX (SAM) .....	102
FIGURE 9: REPRESENTATION OF THE ECONOMIC SYSTEM IN THE TYPICAL CGE MODEL .....	115
FIGURE 10: CIRCULATION IN CGE MODELS .....	117
FIGURE 11: A COUPLED IO+EC MODEL .....	127
FIGURE 12: EXAMPLE OF CAUSAL DIAGRAM FOR URBAN AREA. ....	137
FIGURE 13: REMI MODEL .....	175